Online auhthentication methods

"Evaluate the strength of online authentication methods"









Introduction

Cornel de Jong System and Network Engineering Universiteit van Amsterdam Spui 21 1012WX Amsterdam

Supervisors: UvA: Cees de Laat Deloitte: Gijs Hollestelle Tom Schuurmans

Research Project

Research question:

..." Review new and existing online authentication methods in such a way that it is possible to create a "Comparison Matrix" which contains the authentication methods, characteristics and protection against attack vectors."...

Research goal:

The goal is to define a method to make a well-funded choice for an online authentication method in a customer specific situation, based on the Comparison Matrix.

Agenda

- Project background
- Authentication methods
- Characteristics
- Attack vectors
- Comparison Matrix
- Scenario



Antiphishing.org

November 2007



- Financial Services (93.8%)
- Retail (2.8%)
- ISP (2.2%)
- Government & Miscellaneous (1.2%)





Authenticate

Something you know

• PIN

• Password

Something you have

- RSA SecurID
- Elcard, USB tokens

Something you are

- Fingerprint, Iris
- Voice, Face

Multifactor authentication

- One-Factor Authentication
- Two-Factor Authentication
- Three-Factor Authentication



In-Band versus Out-Of-Band



Authentication methods

- Password (only)
- SIM Toolkit
- Hardware Token
- Graphical
- EMV Smartcard
- PKI Smartcard
- One Time Password
- Bookmark

Virtual keyboard

- No hardware keyboard required
- Requires Flash / JavaScript
- Random positioning of the characters
- Prevents keylogger attacks
- But makes it easier for shoulder surfing and screen capturing

Virtual keyboard examples



Welcome to Citibank Online

Login to your Account

Your card number

Use your mouse to enter your IPIN(Internet Password)

Please Note : Your IPIN is NOT case sensitive



Still have problems logging in ? <u>Click here</u> to login using keyboard

Virtual keyboard examples 2

A more sophisticated example of the Dexia bank (Luxembourg)



https://secure.dexiapluspro.lu/pro/logon_flash.asp?lang=nl&clifpversion=9&clifpok=true

PassFaces

- Graphical authentication
- JavaScript, ActiveX, Java
- Completely mobile
- User selects a face from each page
- Custom image databases available
- Prevents keylogger attacks

PassFaces 2





Passfaces are picked tram sets of 9 faces. You determine the number of sets.

http://www.realuser.com/enterprise/demo/try_passfaces.htm

One Time Password manual

- Elcard
- Different layouts
- Different form factors
- A Scratch card adds a little more security





http://www.elca.ch/live/3/resources/demo_en/main.html

Bookmark authentication

- Use a Bookmark as a "virtual token"
- Token is not send over the network
- JavaScript to read the token
- No Cookies are used

https://site.com/login#[TOKEN]

Examples are:

- BeamAuth
- PhishCops

Characteristics

- Additional hardware
- Additional software
- Complexity
- Scalability
- Portability
- Login time
- System requirements
- Acquisition costs
- Deployment costs
- Operating costs

Comparison Matrix Characteristics

The Comparison Matrix shows the authentication methods and their characteristics, based on a scale from 1 to 5, where higher is better.

- Investigate the available options
- Assign values to the authentication methods

Characteristic

s:

Authentication methods:

	Additional	Additional					System	Acquisition	Deployment	Operating	Total
	hardware	software	Complexity	Scalability	Portability	Login time	requirements	Cost	Cost	Cost	score
Username & Password	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2	47
Partial password	5	5	5	5	5	3	5	5	4	2	44
Virtual Keyboard	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	39
SIM Toolkit (HandyID)	3	1	3	2	4	2	2	3	4	4	28
RSA SecurID	2	5	2	2	3	3	5	1	1	3	27
Passmark Sitekey (now RSA)	5	2	3	3	1	4	5	3	3	4	33
Passfaces	5	5	4	3	5	3	5	3	3	4	40
Passpicture	5	5	4	3	5	3	5	3	3	4	40
EMV Smartcard	1	1	1	2	3	3	1	1	2	3	18
Public Key Infrastructure (PKI) Smartcard	1	1	1	2	3	3	1	1	2	3	18
One Time Password manual (Elcard)	4	5	5	2	3	4	5	4	4	5	41
One Time Password manual (Scratchcard)	4	5	5	2	3	2	5	4	4	5	39
One Time Password automatic (SMS)	3	5	4	4	4	1	3	2	3	4	33
One Time Password synchronous	1	5	1	2	3	3	1	1	2	3	22
One Time Password a-synchronous	1	5	1	2	3	3	1	1	2	3	22
Bookmark authentication	5	5	4	4	2	4	5	3	4	5	41

(Score based on scale 1 -- 5, higher is better)

Attack vectors

- Shoulder surfing
- Keylogger
- Screen capturing
- Brute force (exhaustive search)
- Guess attack (knowing someone)
- Dictionary attack
- Hardware (observation) attack
- Social engineering
- Phishing attack
- Man In The Middle (MITM) attack
- Man In The Browser (MITB) attack
- Network sniffing
- Short access

Attack vectors explained

Guess attack

Useful for "secret questions" (password forgotten). Name of your first pet? / Mothers first name?

Search information through sites like: Hyves and MySpace.

Hardware (observation) attack Vary from copy a TAN code list to an electron microscope.

Attack vectors explained 2

Man In The Browser attack

- Installed by a Trojan Horse
- Similar to MITM
- Works inside the web browser
- No hyperlink to click on
- Activates by typing an URL
- Hard to prevent and disinfect

Attack vectors explained 3

Short access

Is it possible to do a successful login when an attacker has short physical access to the computer / hardware?

Comparison Matrix Attack vectors

The Comparison Matrix shows the authentication methods and the attack vectors. Through the use of values which represent the probability to succeed the attack.

Based on a scale from 1 to 5 where higher is a better resistance against the attack. Likely to succeed the attack:

- 1 = very likely
 - 2 = likely
- 3 = possible
- 4 = not likely
- 5 = negligible

					Guess									
	Shoulder		Screen	Brute force	attack (knowing	Dictionary	Hardware	Social	Phishing	Man In The	Man In The	Network	Short	Total
	surfina	Kevloager	capturing	search)	someone)	attack	attack	enaineerina	attack	attack	attack	sniffina	access	score:
	g													
Jsername & Password	3	1	4	2	2	1	5	3	1	1	2	1	3	29
Partial password	4	3	5	1	3	2	5	3	3	1	2	2	3	37
/irtual Keyboard	1	5	1	2	2	1	5	3	3	1	3	3	3	33
SIM Toolkit (HandyID)	5	4	4	5	5	5	4	5	4	4	5	5	4	59
RSA SecurID	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	57
Passmark Sitekey (now RSA)	3	2	3	3	3	2	5	2	2	3	3	4	3	38
Passfaces	2	5	2	3	1	3	5	3	3	3	3	3	4	40
Passpicture	2	5	2	4	2	3	5	4	3	3	3	3	4	43
EMV Smartcard	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	5	4	61
Public Key Infrastructure (PKI) Smartcard	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	5	4	61
Dne Time Password manual (Elcard)	3	4	4	4	5	5	1	3	3	3	3	4	1	43
Dne Time Password manual (scratch card)	3	4	4	4	5	5	3	3	3	3	3	4	2	46
Dne Time Password Automatic (SMS)	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	3	56
Dne Time Password synchronous	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	5	58
One Time Password a-synchronous	4	4	4	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	4	5	60
Bookmark authentication	3	3	3	3	4	4	5	4	4	4	2	4	3	46

(Likely to succeed the attack: [1 = very likely], [2 = likely], [3 = possible], [4 = not likely], [5 = negligible])

An online banking site wants to offer customers safe login, even from an internet-cafe abroad. The solution must be highly resistant against:

- Shoulder surfing
- Keyloggers
- Screen capturing

At least 3 or higher is required for these items (higher is preferred)

Usable in an internet café abroad This points out 3 important characteristics:

- Additional software
- Additional hardware
- Portability

When we apply the requirements on the Comparison Matrix Characteristics, this results in the following authentication methods:

- Username & Password
- Partial password
- Virtual Keyboard
- PassFaces
- Passpictures
- One Time Password manual (Elcard)
- One Time Password manual (Scratchcard)
- One Time Password automatic SMS

Shown from the Comp. Matrix

Characteristic

Authentication methods: s:

•

	Additional Additional							
	hardware	software	Complexity	Scalability	Portability			
Username & Password	5	5	5	5	5			
Partial password	5	5	5	5	5			
Virtual Keγboard	5	4	4	4	4			
	3	1	3	2	4			
	2	5	2	2	3			
	5	2	3	3	1			
Passfaces	5	5	4	3	5			
Passpicture	5	5	4	3	5			
	1	1	1	2	3			
	1	1	1	2	3			
One Time Password manual (Elcard)	4	5	5	2	3			
One Time Password manual (Scratchcard)	4	5	5	2	3			
One Time Password automatic (SMS)	3	5	4	4	4			
	1	5	1	2	3			
	1	5	1	2	3			
	5	5	4	4	2			

The result of the Characteristics is now used in the Comparison Matrix Attack vectors. Here we will check how resistant the authentication methods are against the selected attacks, in this scenario:

- Shoulder surfing
- Keyloggers
- Screen capturing

We now apply the selected attacks on the Comparison Matrix Attack vector. Here we select (from the remaining) authentication methods with a 3 or higher, this results in the following authentication methods:

- One Time Password manual (Elcard)
- One Time Password manual (Scratchcard)
- One Time Password automatic SMS

Shown from the Comp. Matrix

Authentication method:	Attack vectors:					
			_			
	Shoulder surfing	Keylogger	Screen capturing			
	3	1	4			
	4	3	5			
	1	5	1			
	5	4	4			
	4	4	4			
	3	2	3			
	2	5	2			
	2	5	2			
	4	5	5			
	4	5	5			
One Time Password manual (Elcard)	3	4	4			
One Time Password manual (scratch card)	з	4	4			
One Time Password Automatic (SMS)	4	4	4			
	4	4	4			
	4	4	4			
	3	3	3			



